

SECOND ANNUAL CONFERENCE ON MUSICAL ICONOGRAPHY

jointly sponsored by

The Greater New York Chapter of the American Musicological Society and  
The Research Center for Musical Iconography of the City University of New York

Graduate Center, 33 West 42nd Street, New York, N.Y. 10036  
March 16, 1974 Third Floor Studio

MORNING SESSION 10:00 to 12:30 Barry S. Brook, Chairman

The Utrecht Psalter and the use of instruments in the early Middle Ages  
JOHN G. MORRIS, City University of New York

The Illuminations in Cambrai MSS 125-128  
GEORGE DIEHL, La Salle College, Philadelphia

Musical constituents in depictions of the Passion and the Three Magi  
WALTER SALMEN, Universities of Kiel, Germany and Innsbruck Austria

Special reports on music iconography activities  
Conference participants.

'NO HOST' LUNCH 12:30 to 2:30 Rosoff's Restaurant  
147 West 43rd Street  
New York, New York

AFTERNOON SESSION 2:30 to 5:00 Christoph Wolff, Chairman

A word about RCMI and RIDIM  
BARRY S. BROOK

Instruments in Ballet Prints 17-18 c.  
LOIS GERTSMAN, City University of New York

A motet for Machiavelli's mistress and a martyr  
COLIN SLIM, University of California at Irvine

The use of written music: singers and players in visual representations  
from Antiquity to the Baroque.  
EMANUEL WINTERNITZ, The Metropolitan Museum of Art

THE GREATER NEW YORK CHAPTER OF THE AMERICAN MUSICOLOGICAL SOCIETY

CHRISTOPH WOLFF, CHAIRMAN

AND

THE RESEARCH CENTER FOR MUSICAL ICONOGRAPHY OF THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

BARRY S. BROOK AND EMANUEL WINTERITZ, DIRECTORS

CONFERENCE ON MUSICAL ICONOGRAPHY, MARCH 16, 1974

SUMMARY OF PROCEEDINGS

Morning Session 10:00 to 12:30 (Barry S. Brook, Chairman)

The chairman gratefully acknowledged the exhibition of French opera posters 1868-1920 which decorated the meeting room. It had been brought to the conference through the efforts of Lucy Broido of Bryn Mawr Pennsylvania. Recently discovered in the storerooms of Heugel et Cie, many of these lithographs had not been viewed publicly since they had been used as advertisements in Paris during the Third Republic. The artists represented included Cheret, Steinlein, Edel, Grasset, Gray, Choubrac, and Orazi.

The first speaker, John Gordon Morris, a graduate student at CUNY, gave a paper entitled "The Utrecht Psalter and the use of instruments in the Early Middle Ages." The Utrecht Psalter can, in Mr. Morris's opinion, illuminate much about the use of musical instruments in the middle ages. He discussed its layout and dating as well as the function of art in the middle ages, the role of the psalms in worship, cultural influences on the manuscript and possible artists. The body of the paper concentrated on organological problems and the relationship of terms in the Psalm text with their accompanying illustrations. In the question period it was brought out that there have been excavations and restorations of the musical instruments of the ancient Hebrews. Dr. Winteritz pointed out that there is often intentional distortion of some musical instruments for the sake of symbolic allegory in the Utrecht Psalter as well as in later art works. The presence of lute-type instruments is a suggestion of Eastern influences, and a possible clue to the area of origin of the manuscript.

Prof. George Diehl, chairman of the Department of Fine Arts of La Salle College in Philadelphia, and program annotator for the Philadelphia

Orchestra, then spoke on "The Illuminations in Cambrai Mss. 125-128." The four part books originally owned by a 16th century merchant from Bruges, Zeghere van Male, have many intriguing illustrations. A fact sheet covered the manuscripts' provenance, physical description, composers, and musical contents. The title pages, initials and margins were all subjected to decoration. The identity of the illuminator is not clear but there is an overall uniformity of style indicating that it is basically the work of one ingenious man. (A constantly recurring visage may be a portrait of the artist.) The speaker tied the work to simultaneous currents in early 16th century genre painting and linked old Flemish proverbs to some of the imagery. He pointed out that many of the illustrations were fantastic, while others were realistic to the point of being journalistic. During the ensuing discussion, it was brought out that art historians have differed over the influences on the manuscript and about the theory of a single illuminator. Only a few of the decorations are illustrative of the text. There are similar pen-washed manuscripts dating from the 15th century, but none from the 16th. The manuscript does not reflect the trouble in Bruges caused by the onset of the Inquisition at that time.

Prof. Walter Salmen of the Universities of Kiel and Innsbruck, then conducting a mini-seminar at CUNY, gave the third paper, "Musical constituents in depictions of the Passion and the Three Magi." After some observations about available sources and the relative importance of iconographical data in the study of music of classical antiquity and the middle ages, he warned that pictures can represent the real or the symbolic. The presence of a musician or dancer in a complex painting requires careful interpretation as the two topics chosen for this paper demonstrate. The medieval practice of public accompanied by musicians (trumpeters, fifers, drummers, and bell ringers) is related to depictions of the suffering of Christ. Although the Gospels according to Matthew, Mark, and John mention only screaming masses in the mocking of Christ, 15th century artists imaginatively added musicians to scenes of the crucifixion. They sometimes blow fantastic instruments to harass the Saviour. The presence of a fool whistling symbolized the human baseness of those who mock suffering. The inspiration for including medieval musicians in Passion scenes came from everyday life; they served as tangible symbols within the experience of the artist and the viewer rather than an attempt to represent the actual happenings on Calvary.

In the depictions of the Magi Kings in the late 15th century, often their retinues contain trumpeters and kettledrummers. According to Matthew, three wise men (Magi) went to Bethlehem for the birth of Christ. In the 12th century a legend arose that these Magi were powerful kings. By the 15th century, these legendary kings were transformed into feudal monarchs who were announced with their customary trumpets and drums. Although these instruments were introduced to Europe as symbols of royalty and privilege by returning Crusaders, in the high middle ages the tradition was so ingrained that many epic poems granted the rulers of

antiquity, like Alexander the Great, and mythological heroes these same musical instruments with no basis in fact. Prof. Salmen showed slides of Magi Kings with medieval musicians in their retinues. Aside from different levels of stylization, this art contains symbolism which must be deciphered and which may contain an illustrative message. A primary task of iconographers in the future should be to discover more and more of these messages. The discussion period dealt with representations of the Last Judgment as an area of music-accompanied punishment, the survival of Roman tradition and the importation of Near Eastern instruments in the use of brass instruments, the relation of punishment scenes to Kathy Meyer-Baer's thesis about the Dance of Death, the degree of reality and symbolism in the Utrecht Psalter, and Dr. Koraljka Kos's study demonstrating that a painting from this time could be a tableau vivant. Prof. Salmen reinforced the point that one must always seek written documentation to support interpretations of pictures.

The next section of the meeting was devoted to informal reports on musico-iconographical activities. Prof. Gerd Muehsam of Queens College spoke on ARLIS/ North America (Art Library Society of North America) which has formed an iconography committee with some members vitally interested in musical iconography. ARLIS plans to establish a formal relationship with the RCMI. (The ARLIS/NA Newsletter 2, 3-4 April 1974 contained a summary of this meeting written by Prof. Muehsam.)

Barbara Lambert, the curator of the musical instrument collection of the Museum of Fine Arts in Boston, and her staff have embarked on a project to survey and catalogue the complete holdings of that museum for examples of musical iconography. They have finished three departments: Egyptian, Classical, and Painting; eventually other museums in the Boston area will be catalogued.

Carolyn Bryant of the Smithsonian Institution, Washington D.C., read a report from Helen Hollis who is in charge of the Institution's music-iconography file. In the last few months Ms. Bryant has been enlarging the American section with special emphasis on items depicting military and social bands.

Prof. John Suess of Case Western Reserve reported that that university has been working very closely with the Cleveland Museum of Art in developing catalogues of the museum's holdings in musical iconography. They have contacted the curators of all other museums in Ohio and many musicologists in an effort to expand the project.

In response to a question about how to avoid duplication of cataloguing effort on prints, the chairman cited the RIDIM instructions which recommend that each country be responsible for the prints originating in that country. In large countries, different areas could be

responsible for works published therein.

During the luncheon adjournment, Dr. Jerzy Golos introduced visitors to the tenth floor offices of the RCMI which serves as the international center for RIdIM.

Afternoon Session 2:30-5:00 (Christoph Wolff, Chairman)

Christoph Wolff, the Chairman of the Greater New York Chapter of the A.M.S., opened the afternoon session. Dr. Brook, the first speaker, reported on RCMI and RIdIM developments and methods of accumulation of materials including a summary of teaching activities. He invited members of the audience to send musico-iconographical materials to the RCMI offices where they would be catalogued and added to the project's holdings. Inquiries may be addressed to the center; every effort will be made to identify, analyze, date or locate pictorial materials.

In the past year there were two areas designated by RIdIM for concentrated international accumulation: 1) Italian religious painting of the 16th century, and 2) engravings, paintings and sculpture relating to performance practice of the classical period, roughly 1740-1830. RIdIM committees in different countries, plus individual specialists and collectors, have been asked to gather and catalogue materials in these fields and to send them to the RCMI office. Various methods of redistribution and eventual and eventual publication were discussed. M. de Mink in Leyden is ready to help with microfiche editions. At a prior ad hoc meeting of the Commission Mixte of RIdIM, made up of representatives from the IMS, IAML, and ICOM (International Council of Museums), the following subjects were nominated as possible areas of concentration in the future. The eight topics were chosen to sample different approaches to iconography in order to learn the advantages and disadvantages of each: a single instrument, a family of instruments, a school of painting, a single genre, the performance practice of a single period, a sociological approach, etc. Members of the audience were polled as to their interests in working on these topics, with the following results.

	<u>Subject</u>	<u>Volunteers</u>
1.	Greek Vases	1
2.	Religious Art 1400-1530	15
3.	Viol Family (including bows)	18
4.	Musical Inscriptions	25
5.	Drums and Drummers ca. 1600 (a sociological study)	10
6.	Musical Paintings of the <u>Caravaggistes</u>	10
7.	Performance Practice in Ensemble Music of the Classic Period	20
8.	Portraits of Composers and Musicians	15

Two additional topics were discussed: American musical instruments which was deemed to be more appropriate for local rather than international study and baroque performance practice which was thought to have been more extensively investigated than many other periods.

The first paper of the afternoon, delivered by Lois Gertsman, a graduate student at CUNY, was entitled "Instruments in Ballet Prints 17th-18th Centuries." The paper explored how instruments were used in ballet prints, under what circumstances they were depicted, and what may be learned from these prints about the function of music and musicians in ballet. The sample of 150 prints, mostly drawn from the collection of the New York Public Library Dance Division at Lincoln Center, ranged from the Ballet Comique de la Reine 1581 to Armide et Renaud 1785. Prints depicting ballet scenes are almost as old as ballet itself. Ballet performances from the late 16th century to the 18th century were often followed by the publication of sets of engravings issued in souvenir libretti. Ms. Gertsman discussed the reliability of the depictions, especially in crowded scenes. She divided ballet prints into two categories: 1) portraits of dancers and costume designs and 2) stage scenes and scenes of the orchestra during a performance. She traced the evolution of the ballet orchestra as to its composition, size, and its location within the theater. Instruments in stage scenes are usually so small and indistinctly drawn that not much can be learned about the instruments themselves or the manner of playing them. It is in providing information about the orchestration and the location of the orchestra in relation to the stage that the engravings prove useful.

The next paper entitled "A motet for Machiavelli's mistress and a martyr," delivered by Prof. H. Colin Slim of the University of California at Irvine, was a study of a single painting by Domenico Puligo. The analysis illustrated the kinds of problems Dr. Slim encountered doing research for his forthcoming book Musical Inscriptions in Medieval and Renaissance Art. After tracing discussions of the painting from Vasari and Borghini, through 18th century catalogues, to the writings of 20th century critics, he analyzed each inscription with regard to classical allusions, possible puns, and literary symbolism. The complex musico-poetic double-entendres led through a labyrinth of possibilities including evidence that a French chanson in the painting was painted over with the insignia of Saint Lucy at the request of a zealous Italian noblewoman. Dr. Slim concluded that the lady depicted was La Barbara, Machiavelli's mistress, and that Machiavelli commissioned the work, directing the painter to include the inscriptions which indicated her intellectual and amorous accomplishments. A Latin motet in an opened music book held by La Barbara used a text from the Song of Songs. The music remains unidentified, with a possibility that it was composed for the painting. In addition, under the lady's left hand appears a French chanson text "J'aime bien mon amy de bonne amour certaine." The placement of the lady's hand over "certaine" perhaps indicates that the painting dates from before 1525 when, in fact, she became his mistress. Other means of dating from stylistic considerations support a range between 1523 and 1525. The presence of a French chanson in the painting was explained by the presence of French singers in Florence at the time, including Verdelot, who composed theatrical madrigals for Machiavelli and La Barbara in 1525, Bruet, and d'Argentil.



Dr. Emanuel Winternitz presented the final paper of the afternoon: "The use of written music: singers and players in visual representations from Antiquity to the Baroque." He opened with several questions formulated to serve as catalysts for team research: Toward what end should visual evidence be collected? How should a hypothesis be constructed and how can this hypothesis be refined? With reference to the topic under consideration, when, from antiquity to the baroque, do we find written music in the hands of singers? Is there a distinction between singers and instrumentalists with respect to written music? How does this appear in separate and combined groups of singers and players in sacred and secular music? How should one interpret this information?

Some of the best sources for visual evidence in the renaissance are the Coronation of the Virgin paintings. Many singers and players are systematically included, especially in scenes of Mary rising to heaven. The singers most often use scores; the instrumentalists do not. In the more intimate Sacre Conversazione there is never any written music nor singing, but a putto improvising on a lute or especially on a lira da braccia is very common. There are both realistic and fantastic depictions of the Apocalypse, and one must be wary of any evidence about supposed performing ensembles taken from scenes of the twenty four elders; however here too, the singers often have music while the instrumentalists seldom do.

Dr. Winternitz presented many slides of master works with analyses directed towards a solution of the problem. His selection included ten reliefs by Luca della Robbia depicting the 150th Psalm, the Assumption of the Virgin by the Master of St. Lucy (hanging at the National Gallery in Washington D.C.), and a cupola by Gaudenzio Ferrari, in addition to works by Caravaggio, Veronese, Raphael, Van Eyck, Breugel, Titian, and a host of others. His conclusion was that the use of written music by instrumentalists started around 1600 and was almost universally adopted within one generation. He tied this to the rise of virtuosic solo instruments, the change of style associated with baroque music, and the discarding of the older concept of the homogenous families of instruments playing together like the chest of viols or the consort of recorders, illustrated in Praetorius's treatment of these instruments. The previous tradition of singers using music accompanied by instrumentalists improvising is documented visually as far back as the Roman Empire in wall paintings excavated at Pompeii. There is an admitted lack of evidence about the middle ages. The earliest examples of players reading music occur in the 1480's; they are depictions of organists. This coincides generally with the invention of tablatures for keyboard instruments.