

March 17, 1973

The Greater New York Chapter of the American Musicological Society and  
the Research Center for Musical Iconography of the City Univer-  
sity of New York, Graduate Center (33 West 42 Street),  
Third Floor Studio

MORNING SESSION 10:00 to 12:30 (Barry S. Brook, Chairman)

Opening Remarks

Cataloguing and Classification Problems: the RIdIM Card

Development of Photo Archives

Areas of Concentration

- a) international cooperative exchange projects
- b) national projects in France, Germany, and the United States
- c) discussion of individual projects (from all participants)

Publication Potentials

- a) De Mink Microfiche Project
- b) Minkoff Iconographic Series (directed by F. Lesure)
- c) RIdIM Newsletter and Annual, RIdIM Monographs
- d) Directory of scholars active
- e) Checklist of photo archives

Plans and New Business

LUNCH at Rosoff's Restaurant, 147 West 43rd Street

AFTERNOON SESSION 3:00 to 5:30 (Christoph Wolff, Chairman)

The New Musico-Iconographical Project: RIdIM (Barry S. Brook)  
Le Centre d'Iconographie Musicale in Paris (Mme G. Thibault de Chambure)  
The Research Center for Musical Iconography in New York (Richard Leppert)

Musical Instruments as Portrait Props in Western European Paintings  
and Drawings, Ca. 1600 to Ca. 1830 (Mary Rasmussen)

Musical Scenes in Old Polish Paintings (Jerzy Golos)

Open String and Stopped String Cultures in Classical Antiquity:  
A Chapter in the Iconology of Music (Emanuel Winternitz)

THE GREATER NEW YORK CHAPTER OF THE AMERICAN MUSICOLOGICAL SOCIETY

CHRISTOPH WOLFF, CHAIRMAN

AND

THE RESEARCH CENTER FOR MUSICAL ICONOGRAPHY OF THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

BARRY S. BROOK AND EMANUEL WINTERNITZ, DIRECTORS

CONFERENCE ON MUSICAL ICONOGRAPHY, MARCH 17, 1973

SUMMARY OF PROCEEDINGS

Morning Session 10:00 to 12:30 (Barry S. Brook, Chairman)

Opening Remarks

The Chairman introduced the Co-Presidents of RIdIM, Mme G. Thibault de Chambure and Dr. Harald Heckmann, as well as the chairman of the Greater New York Chapter of the American Musicological Society, Dr. Christoph Wolff. A special welcome was extended to non-music specialists who came to participate in discussions. No undertaking of this kind could succeed without the close cooperation of museum directors, librarians, and musicologists. This meeting signals the establishment of the U.S. national center for the international RIdIM project sponsored by the International Musicological Society, the International Association of Music Libraries, and the International Council of Museums. The history of RIdIM since its formal establishment in St. Gall in 1971 was outlined.

Cataloguing and Classification Problems: the RIdIM Card

The RIdIM Master Catalogue Card and its instruction sheets have been under development for over two years, and have undergone a number of metamorphoses based on the advice of experts in and outside the field of musicology.

Richard D. Leppert described how the card will work on an international basis in an effort to gather and exchange materials. The card is designed specifically for visual documentation in Western art, but as the project continues, separate terminology will be produced to handle non-Western materials as well. The card was discussed, category by category. The person filling in the card is asked only to supply information of which he is certain. One major change is anticipated in the current terminology. A comprehensive list of musical instruments is being prepared in Paris by CIMCIM, and will be incorporated into the RIdIM Master Catalogue Card instructions when it is

finished, replacing the present list. The CIMCIM code is a six-figure numerical code, designed not only to name an instrument, but to indicate specific organological features as well.

The point was made that perhaps a category under "Totals" might be added to indicate the total number of music books, etc. found in a representation, since more than one performer could read from a single partbook.

John Russell: Inscriptions on pictures, engravings, etc. should be indicated.

Mr. Leppert: All supplied inscriptions, signatures, dates, etc. should be listed on the back of the card under "Documentation."

Edwin M. Ripin: It is of the utmost importance to add such a rubric to the instructions, since one should be able to determine what is expert opinion and what is indisputable fact about any object. For graphics, supplied inscriptions should be copied literally no matter what the language, along with a translation, if desired.

Mr. Brook: Such legends should be placed under "Title."

Mr. Ripin: Supplied titles should be differentiated from museum titles.

Elizabeth Roth: Not enough space has been allotted under "Artist." As many as three artists may work on a single piece (with an engraving: the painter, the one who made the drawing after the painting, and the engraver, not to mention the publisher).

It was asked whether analysis of performers and instruments proceeds from right to left, left to right, or at random.

Frédéric Thieck: Left to right is usually better, although with multi-level works, one proceeds clockwise.

Mr. Brook: It would be a simple matter to add quotation marks around any title information supplied by the artist.

Mr. Leppert demonstrated the cross-referencing potential of one completed RIdIM card. One of the chief difficulties encountered in subject-indexing involves musical instruments. RIdIM seeks to index not only names of instruments, but organological features as well. A hierarchy must be established for the listing of such features. For a wind instrument, for example, it is necessary to consistently follow some order of discussion: e.g., type of mouthpiece, overall shape, number of fingerholes, etc. The CIMCIM code would be useful in this matter.

Harry B. Lincoln: Has thought been given to the formulation of RIdIM and Local Sigla, space for which is provided on the RIdIM card, as discrete identifications of each object?

Mr. Brook: Yes. Furthermore, the card was designed for computerization, although RIdIM will not be automated until 1975, by which time cataloging and classification problems will have been resolved.

The chairman described the book by Howard Brown and Joan Lascelle, Musical Iconography, with regard to the classification of instruments. This classification system is based on details which are assumed to be true about each instrument. Features which do not conform to the assumed details are noted. The chief advantage to this system is that it reduces the number of details which must be listed each time an instrument is catalogued.

It was asked whether any international iconographic classification is being or has been developed.

Mr. Brook: The Iconclass system by Hans van de Waal of the University of Leiden is the one major project in this area. The system is complex and has not been completed. It allows easy access to any combination of iconographic elements, musical or otherwise, by a numerical-alphabetical code.

Edith Jaenicke: Each discipline might work out its own Iconclass system which could be later added to a revised, unabridged Iconclass classification. RIdIM, for example, could work out the terminology for musical iconography.

Mr. Brook: RIdIM is in touch with the museum computer network in the U.S., and with parallel systems in England and Germany.

### Development of Photo Archives

The Chairman invited photo archive specialists in attendance to offer opinions on methods of organizing photo archives. He described the files of the Frick Art Reference Library, the New York Public Library Picture Collection, and the Index of Christian Art at Princeton.

Ms. Jaenicke: The photo collection at the Institute of Fine Arts of Princeton University is actually comprised of several special collections. One, available by subscription, contains photographs of European drawings from European collections. A standardized format is used: the photos are 5x7, mounted on 8x10. Another collection is devoted to Italian paintings. It includes all types and sizes of material, some 50 years old or older. Photos are contained in legal-size folders. In taking over an old collection, one should take care to preserve information written on the backs of the photos. This information may be very important, particularly if it is in the handwriting of a particular art historian.

Wolfgang Freitag: The collection at Harvard contains 350,000 photographs organized entirely on art historical principles, with no subject cataloging except for religious subjects and a few Green and Roman deities which are frequently used. The collection consists mostly of 8x10 glossy photos, on 11x14 mounts, filed in metal

filing cabinets. There are also another 350,000 photographs in various arrangements which lend themselves to retrieval without cataloguing. The system used is that developed by the Metropolitan Museum, based on medium, period, and artist. There is a slightly different approach to Oriental art, where period is more important than medium.

Gerd

a photograph collection with subject headings, but no actual organizational system. The picture collection at the Cooper-Hewitt Museum contains all kinds of subjects. It is modelled after the picture collection of the Musée des Arts Décoratifs in Paris. Subject-oriented scrapbooks are filed in X-ray size metal cases. Headings follow the Library of Congress classification system; this proved to be unworkable, however. There is also an alphabetical system with period and topic subdivisions. At Queens College, a small collection, thin material is used for standard photographic mounts because it takes up only about 1/3 the space of a conventional mount. It does not, however, wear well.

Jack Perry Brown: The Mellon Collection specializes in British art, primarily painting and sculpture. When finished, it will encompass about 200,000 photographs. Photos will be mounted on sturdy, acid-free board in boxes similar to the Frick boxes, on standard library shelving. A mechanized subject retrieval system is being developed in connection with the Yale Computer Center. This will encompass a computer catalogue to the collection, and will facilitate mass searches. It will produce not only the artist and title and collection listings, but an analysis based on a standard subject thesaurus. It will probably resemble the thesaurus in use at the Victoria and Albert Prints and Drawings Collection, with certain adaptations.

Mr. Freitag: Art historians would maintain that the most important elements are the image and the photo source. A second goal which may either be approached simultaneously or put off until later is the feeding into the computer of material for which one may make on-demand searches.

Mr. Ripin: The photograph collections at the Metropolitan Museum are mounted on large mounts, approximately 11x14. It is important that these be sturdy, as they are subject to much wear. They are kept in file cabinets, but could as well be kept in boxes. The present discussion has considered two separate problems. One is retrieval, the other is the actual copy. A question related to the Hague project is, Is there any hope of eventually arriving at an archive to which the user could apply for a photograph?

Mr. Brook: That is a question which must be left to the future. It is certainly development of the technology which would make this a simple procedure. An interesting development in this area was recently reported to us by Peter Kaufman, of the State University of New York at Buffalo. It involves microfilming file cards by an automatic method at the rate of about 120 cards per minute.

Helen Hollis: The visual material at the Smithsonian Institution consists of about 3000 8x10 glossy photographs, filed in a filing case and legal size file folders, unmounted.

Denis Stevens: At Columbia University, our information is stored on microfilm. Because of the common use of the SLR Reflex Camera, all material is reduced to a standard size frame.

Ms. Jaenicke: In the exhibition catalogues of the Cooper Union Museum, we arranged the photographs by subject, and the card file by country, artist, period, and medium.

Areas of Concentration: International, national, and individual projects

Chairman: This project must try to find ways of channeling efforts so that most effective results can be obtained. The function of the national committees is to work within each country to gather information about the original materials which are stored in the museums and libraries there. National projects in France, Germany, and the United States are of particular interest to the participants in today's meeting.

Mme G. Thibault de Chambure: Some of the more important current projects in France are studies on the status of musical instruments in Brittany, on paintings and sculpture in the Strasbourg region, and on monumental sculpture of the Romanesque period. In addition, M. Thieck is compiling a checklist of all depictions of musical instruments in the Louvre. At the Bibliothèque Nationale, a catalogue of engravings and etchings of musical representations is being prepared, and corresponding photographs are being collected.

Harald Heckmann: In Germany, there is a working group, the Arbeitsgruppe für Museumsdokumentation, which plans to document all museum materials in Germany and the Netherlands. We hope to establish a national working group for RIDIM similar to the ones which we have for RILM and RISM.

Mr. Brook: A number of other European countries have done extraordinary work in iconography; among them are Yugoslavia, the Nordic countries, and Great Britain. Scholars in these areas are informed of the nature of the RIDIM project, and have indicated their willingness to cooperate with those who seek specific information.

Ruth Watanabe: As the Eastman School of Music is located in Rochester, New York, the home of Kodak, we have certain incentives in the direction of collecting art material on slides. We are also a part of a state organization called the Five Associated University Libraries (FAUL). FAUL hopes to canvass various museums and art collections in the immediate areas of the member libraries, thereby producing a kind of union catalogue which would be of use to our students.

Harold Samuel: The library at Yale does not yet have a collection, but we do have about 200-300 prints. We recently purchased a collection from Marc Pincherle, which consists of about a thousand prints from the 18th and early 19th centuries.

Ms. Hoover: The Abigail Booth project, entitled the Bicentennial Inventory of American Paintings Executed before 1914 is under the National Collection of Fine Arts. It will catalogue by author, title, and subject paintings in American collections.

Chairman: With the 1976 bicentennial celebration fast upon us, has there been any increased interest in Americana?

Thor Wood: There is an interest in Americana, but not in iconography. The New York Public Library, for example, collects photographs of jazz musicians.

Chairman: I would like to indicate that the RIdIM card is not limited in respect to medium, and includes the photograph.

Barbara Lambert: The musical instruments collection at the Museum of Fine Arts in Boston contains about 5000 photographs and slides. We are searching the museum item by item, looking for examples of musical iconography. There are ten departments; so far, we have finished the Egyptian collection, the paintings department, and the classics department, including the coins. We are presently working in the department of prints and drawings, which has a collection of 300,000 prints alone.

Mary Rasmussen: Faced with the prospect of teaching a seminar in iconography at a university with no art history collection, I have been making an index of reproductions in the Burlington Magazine and Art Quarterly. I hope to mimeograph them, and make them available for people who are in the same predicament.

Chairman: This is an area in which cooperative effort can be most useful. In the Photo Archive in Paris, a number of periodical runs have been indexed. Through RIdIM, we should be able to avoid duplication of effort.

Mrs. Janos Scholz: The Ernest Schelling Collection consists of 4x5 glass slides. There are sections on paintings, history of musical instruments, composers, and geographic areas. The index is a large series of books in which all slides are reproduced. Books are organized by subject. Subjects are assigned numbers: all 1000 numbers represent strings, 2000 represent woodwinds, and so forth.

Laura Boulton: My collection contains about 5000 photographs, as well as about 100 paintings done by one artist. I have made slides from rare books, located only in their countries of origin, and have successfully photographed slides from a screen. I use a card catalogue, with the photograph of the instrument on the back of the card. A question: Is the RIdIM card applicable to non-Western materials?

Mr. Brook: The card was originally conceived for Western art, but it can be used with very slight emendations for non-Western art as well. We recommend the instrument designations presented in the UNESCO book prepared by Jean Jenkins' committee.

## Publication Potentials

Chairman: On display is the de Mink series of 600 engravings. This series will be fully catalogued with all details. Mr. de Mink is prepared to photograph other collections, either from original prints or from photographs of paintings. There is also a series of iconographical publications directed by François Lesure, published by Minkoff. This would deal with specific subjects or with the work of a single artist, in reproduction. There have been a number of suggestions for a RIdIM newsletter or annual. Included in such a publication might be checklists and individual monographs. A publication of this type should not be permanent, however, because musical iconography is a sub-discipline of musicology and should ultimately become part and parcel of it.

## Afternoon Session 3:00 to 5:30 (Christoph Wolff, Chairman)

The Chairman welcomed the assembly, and thanked Mr. Brook and Mr. Leppert of the Research Center for Musical Iconography for preparing and organizing the meeting.

### The New Musico-Iconographical Project: RIdIM - - - Barry S. Brook

The RIdIM project comes in the tradition of RILM and RISM, and is sponsored by the IMS, IAML, and ICOM. The Co-President designated by ICOM is Mme de Chambure, the Co-President designated by IAML is Mr. Heckmann, and I represent the IMS. We have had a number of international meetings in St. Gall, Bologna, and Copenhagen. RIdIM is organized in a manner quite similar to that of RILM and RISM. There will be national centers in each country to gather, classify, and catalogue materials. Individuals working in iconography will collect data from libraries and museums in their areas, and will send it to the Research Center here for cataloguing and exchange.

### Le Centre d'Iconographie Musicale in Paris - - - Mme G. Thibault de Chambure

The Centre d'Iconographie Musicale in Paris contains 8000 large photographs and 2000 diapositives. There are about 30,000 cards in the filing and index systems. Each instrument is cross-referenced to a picture, and classified by artist, location, etc. Our holdings include works from France, Italy, Flanders, Spain, and Holland, from the 14th through 19th centuries. We have reproductions of paintings, drawings, etchings, sculpture, enamel, stained glass windows, and tapestry.

The Centre gives classes in organology. Among the Centre's current projects are a study of French frescoes and a checklist of paintings and drawings on musical subjects in the Louvre. We provide documentation for television and record jackets, and prepare travelling exhibitions.

[Mme de Chambure showed slides of instruments to demonstrate the kind of material which the Centre prepares for students and teachers.]



The Research Center for Musical Iconography in New York - - Richard D. Leppert

The Co-Directors of the Research Center for Musical Iconography are Barry S. Brook and Emanuel Winternitz. In addition, the center is staffed by two research assistants and myself, the research associate. Courses in iconography and organology are taught by Mr. Winternitz at the Metropolitan Museum of Art, under the auspices of the City University.

Our archive presently consists of a melange of material: postcards, Bärenreiter and Peters calendars, glossy photographs, some old original prints, and about 3500 2¼-inch square color transparencies and black-and-white originals. The latter materials are from the late 18th century: portraits of musicians, autographs, pictures of buildings of historical interest, etc., with special emphasis on Haydn, Mozart, Beethoven, Schubert, and their contemporaries. We are presently cataloguing and analyzing all of this using the RIdIM card. We are also establishing a highly selective reference library of primary and secondary sources on musical instruments, iconography, and art in general. Eventually, the archive will be open to all scholars who wish to use it.

Musical Instruments as Portrait Props in Western European Paintings and Drawings, Ca. 1600 to Ca. 1830 - - - Mary Rasmussen

[Ms. Rasmussen showed a large number of slides of Western European portraits in which musical instruments appear, and discussed elements of iconographical significance.]

Musical Scenes in Old Polish Paintings - - - Jerzy Golos

Musical scenes on organ cases and designs for organ cases are important sources of documentation for iconographers. A scholar working with Polish materials should be in touch not only with libraries and museums, but with the Church as well.

[Mr. Golos showed and dicussed slides of organ cases and designs for organ cases with music-making angels. He also dealt with other important visual sources: the frontispiece of a musical treatise, encyclopedia illustrations, paintings, an alterpiece, and a music stand decorated with musical scenes in relief.]

Open String and Stopped String Cultures in Classical Antiquity: A  
Chapter in the Iconology of Music - - - Emanuel Winternitz

Visual and literary evidence indicates that Greek culture, with its varieties of lyres and kitharas, restricted itself to open string technique. In its restriction, ancient Greek instrumental practice seems to be an isolated realm; lutes existed before and after, and even contemporary with, the Greek lyre - for instance, in Egypt and the Near East; but these made hardly an impact on Greece. This puzzling phenomenon is an example of the good use we may expect from musical iconology--not only to register what was there and then, but rather to ask why something was not there and then.

[Mr. Winternitz illustrated his paper with slides showing lyres and lutes being played in civilizations from ancient Egypt to the Middle Ages.]